

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
11 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
12

13 WONGAB CORPORATION,

14 Plaintiff,

15
16 vs.

17 TARGET CORPORATION; et al.,

18 Defendants.
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Case No. 2:18-cv-02625-JAK (ASx)
Hon. John A. Kronstadt Presiding
Referred to Hon. Alka Sagar

PROTECTIVE ORDER

1 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
2 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to
3 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
4 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
5 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order
6 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
7 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
8 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in
9 a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be
10 part of the public record of this case.

11 2. DEFINITIONS

12 2.1 Action: The federal lawsuit identified above, styled Wongab Corporation
13 v. Target Corporation, et al., CD Cal. Case No. 2:18-cv-02625-JAK-AS.

14 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
15 of information or items under this Order.

16 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
17 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
18 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
19 the Good Cause Statement.

20 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
21 support staff).

22 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
23 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
24 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

25 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
26 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
27

1 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced
2 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

3 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
4 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve
5 as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

6 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
7 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
8 counsel.

9 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
10 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

11 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
12 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
13 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
14 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

15 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
16 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
17 support staffs).

18 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
19 Discovery Material in this Action.

20 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
21 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
22 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
23 and their employees and subcontractors.

24 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
25 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

1 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
2 from a Producing Party.

3 3. SCOPE

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.
9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial
10 judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11 4. DURATION

12 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as
13 confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and
14 will be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press,
15 unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed
16 otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City
17 and County of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing
18 “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from
19 “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are part of court
20 record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the
21 commencement of the trial.

22 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

24 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
25 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
26 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
27
28

1 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
2 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
3 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
4 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

5 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
6 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
7 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
8 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
9 Designating Party to sanctions.

10 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
11 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
12 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

13 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
14 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
15 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
16 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
17 produced.

18 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

19 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
20 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
21 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
22 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
23 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
24 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
25 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

1 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
2 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
3 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
4 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
5 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
6 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
7 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
8 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix
9 the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If
10 only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
11 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
12 appropriate markings in the margins).

13 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
14 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
15 deposition all protected testimony.

16 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
17 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent
18 place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is
19 stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the
20 information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,
21 shall identify the protected portion(s).

22 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
23 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
24 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such
25 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
26
27
28

1 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
2 provisions of this Order.

3 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

4 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
5 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
6 Scheduling Order.

7 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
8 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

9 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
10 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
11 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
12 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
13 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
14 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
15 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
16 challenge.

17 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
19 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
20 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
21 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under
22 the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
23 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
24 DISPOSITION).

1 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
2 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
3 authorized under this Order.

4 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
5 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
6 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
7 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

8 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
9 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
10 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

11 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
12 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

13 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
14 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

16 (d) the court and its personnel;

17 (e) court reporters and their staff;

18 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
19 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
20 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

21 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
22 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

23 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the
24 Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing
25 party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2)
26 they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the
27

1 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise
2 agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed
3 deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may
4 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone
5 except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

6 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
7 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
9 IN OTHER LITIGATION

10 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
11 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
12 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

13 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
14 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

15 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
16 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
17 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall
18 include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

19 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
20 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

21 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served
22 with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in
23 this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which
24 the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
25 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
26 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
27
28

1 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
2 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

3 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
4 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

5 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
6 Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
7 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
8 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
9 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

10 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
11 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
12 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
13 confidential information, then the Party shall:

14 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
15 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
16 agreement with a Non-Party;

17 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
18 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
19 specific description of the information requested; and

20 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
21 Non-Party, if requested.

22 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
23 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
24 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
25 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
26 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject
27

1 to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the
2 court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
3 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

4 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

5 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has
6 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized
7 under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a)
8 notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its
9 best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform
10 the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms
11 of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the
12 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit
13 A.

14 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
15 PROTECTED MATERIAL

16 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
17 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
18 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
19 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
20 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
21 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
22 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
23 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or
24 work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the
25 stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any

1 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
2 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
3 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
4 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
5 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
6 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
7 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this
8 Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

9 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
10 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
11 sanctions.

12 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

13
14 Dated: August 30, 2018

By: /s/ Scott Alan Burroughs
Scott Alan Burroughs, Esq.
Justin M. Gomes, Esq.
DONIGER /BURROUGHS
Attorneys for Plaintiff

15
16
17
18 Dated: August 30, 2018

By: /s/ Matthew L. Seror
Matthew L. Seror, Esq.
BUCHALTER
A Professional Corporation
Attorneys for Defendant
TARGET CORPORATION

19
20
21
22
23 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

24 Dated: August 30, 2018

/ s /
Honorable Alka Sagar
United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that
was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California
on [date] in the case of Wongab Corporation v. Target Corporation, et al., CD Cal.
Case No. 2:18-cv-02625-JAK-AS. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all
the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge
that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the
nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any
information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person
or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.
I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for
the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print
or type full name] of _____ [print or
type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of
process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of
this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____